

Durham COVID Response Final cj.mp3

Judith Kelley [00:00:01] So right now, I'm sitting in my home in Durham, North Carolina, and this city, the home of Duke University, has seen rapid growth and expansion over the past couple of decades. And when the first Corona virus cases came to Durham in mid-March, the local government was tasked with containing the outbreak and addressing the struggles of Durham residents. This responsibility is a tall order during a pandemic that's already affected every corner of our lives, from public health to social equality and economic uncertainty. But Durham responded pretty quickly, often with stricter policies than state or national governments. And I think it's fair to say that the local government of Durham has probably never faced a greater challenge than the response to the Corona virus pandemic. I'm Judith Kelley. I'm the dean of the Sanford School of Public Policy at Duke University. And my guests today have all been involved in Durham's newly formed Recovery and Renewal Task Force, which set out to find evidence based solutions to the problems that are resulting from the ongoing pandemic. Ryan Smith is the innovation team project manager for the city of Durham. And he was tasked to head the Recovery and Renewal Task Force. Ryan, of course, graduated from Sanford in 2014 with a master's in public policy. So welcome, Ryan.

Ryan Smith [00:01:36] Thank you Judith. It's great to be here with you today.

Judith Kelley [00:01:39] It's great to have you here. It's always great to hear your voice. We've also been joined by Mariel Beasley as she is a principal at the Duke Center for Advanced Hindsight and co-director of Duke's Common Sense Lab. Mariel researches behavioral economics, and she was brought onto the task force by Ryan to help ensure that the citizens are wearing face masks. That is also a tall order. But Mariel has been prepared for this because she too graduated from the Sanford School in 2013 with a master's of public policy. So welcome, Mariel.

Mariel Beasley [00:02:16] Hello, thanks for having me.

Judith Kelley [00:02:16] It's a pleasure to have you both here. And later, we're going to be joined by another Stanford student who interned with the Durham City Manager's office and helped Ryan manage this task force. Ryan, I want to start out with you. So at the early stages when this task force was was being created, what was motivating that task force being brought together?

Ryan Smith [00:02:37] Well Judith, I was brought on when Mayor Schewel decided to form an additional recovery and renewal task force to bring together community leaders in order to broadly engage our community to help inform both he and the chair of our county commission, Wendy Jacobs, and how to use their their emergency powers under emergency declaration orders, how best to advise them and using that and...

Judith Kelley [00:03:03] Right.

Ryan Smith [00:03:04] When to lift it and how to lift it and other decisions that they needed to make in these unique times. So the task force had its first meeting in, in mid-May, I've been working with Mayor Schewel closely on this since the end of April.

Judith Kelley [00:03:16] What was it like in local government in those early stages?

Ryan Smith [00:03:21] So, you know, in North Carolina, we don't have we don't have strong mayors. So I'll just speak to the mayor side of this and that that means that COVID-19, created a very unique environment for for local political leaders where, you know, usually it's a strong chief executive, a city manager who runs things. But because of these emergency declarations, because of the mayor's ability in this crisis to effectively close down the economy, to decide which parts that would reopen and when, the mayor all of a sudden had incredibly unusual powers for North Carolina. And it was Mayor Schewel's feeling that given those powers that he really wanted to bring together experts from public health experts from Duke epidemiology, bring together business leaders and others to meet regularly to help inform his decisions. He really leads in a very collaborative way and wants to bring bring people along and and have them and inform the decisions that he and and Wendy were having to make basically every week. There were big decisions facing them. And so the goal of this task force was to really give them the best chance possible at at making the right decision. And I think, Mayor Schewel would be the first to say that that part of what it means to lead with humility is understanding that in spite of all of our best efforts to lead, to be evidence based and make hard decisions that are driven by public health and the best of science, we know that we're probably, you know, making some of the wrong decisions sometimes because it's so complex. As you said, it affects every part of Durham. And you're absolutely right that there, it is truly unprecedented in Durham, and I think Mayor Schewel would agree with your statement that we've never faced anything quite like this. And it's very difficult. It's very difficult to make evidence based decisions because you are oftentimes just faced with so many difficult decisions. And it feels like not enough time, not enough time to do your due diligence and research.

Judith Kelley [00:05:21] So, Ryan, I know that you will remember back to your days at the Sanford School that everybody has to delve into questions of ethics. And I think in this crisis, you know, we're talking about being evidence driven. And I think the task force has been set up to provide the mayor with that type of evidence based analysis. But as I'm sure you've had to grapple with, you have to present the mayor with evidence of actions that will have certain consequences for public health. And we know they're going to have those consequences for public health. And at the same time, we have evidence that those same actions will have certain consequences for the economy or for social welfare or for the psychology of children say. So how do you go about building a team that balances some of these different interests and and puts the mayor in a position to make decisions that way? Some of these difficult, conflicting interests?

Ryan Smith [00:06:22] Great question. You know, so I would say the first thing that we did is we recognize you're absolutely right. It's complicated. We have a lot of local experts here in Durham and we have from the beginning tried to find ways to engage them in a process that is fast moving. People we've reached out to include, as you know, yourself and our Sanford faculty. We've reached out to our alums who live in this area, like Mariel Beasley, who's on this call. And as you said, she was one of the very first individuals I reached out to, because one of the things that's really essential is in a crisis like this, a public health crisis, is getting people to follow the best guidance from public health. It's going to be really essential in our recovery and really essential in and being able to reopen an economy. We have tried to create a structure that isn't just a fifteen person task force, but it has multiple other ways for experts and for community residents to plug in meaningfully to the process and help inform it. And so that includes groups of experts who are focused on understanding our vulnerable populations and how we can best serve our vulnerable populations. And all of the kind of complexities that comes with COVID-19 around, whether it be serving our homeless populations or or others in this time. I think one of the challenges that I've learned in a crisis like this is how to organize the work and

how to meaningfully engage people when you're facing difficult decisions. Sometimes early on, it felt like there were difficult decisions every week or every other week that had to be made and decisions from when the state decided to reopen the economy and whether or not that was the right thing for Durham to do. Given that Durham at that time and as we've seen in the early months, had much higher, much higher rates, especially in our Latinx community.

Judith Kelley [00:08:03] You mentioned about providing opportunities for input. So how have some of the voices of the citizens been able to be heard by the task force? What are some of the mechanisms you've used?

Ryan Smith [00:08:15] So we have in addition to this fifteen body task force, we've created what we call roundtables and roundtables are either organized by different kind of industry or interest groups, or they're organized by specific kind of policy areas or populations of interests. And so we have roundtables that are working with our restaurant owners and retail and others to understand the challenges they're facing to support them and being able to safely reopen to safely, to be able to protect their employees and their customers, because we really have to collaborate in this. But we also have a roundtable for our immigrant refugee community, which has been really critical because in Durham, at one point a month, a month and a half ago, we had 80 percent of our new cases were in the Latinx community for a for a population that in Durham makes up about 14 percent. You're talking about, you know, huge disparities there. And so being able to engage in that community, that's you know our roundtables have been important. We have roundtables which meet weekly or every other week. We also have town halls. And then town halls are meant to be broad ways for engaging, engaging community residents and creating ways for the task force and other leaders to listen to their concerns, to understand their challenges that are facing them, to listen to their ideas.

Judith Kelley [00:09:35] Do you feel like citizens have come out for these events? Are you able to hear these voices?

Ryan Smith [00:09:40] Yeah, they're all. Everything is held kind of digitally and remotely.

Judith Kelley [00:09:43] Sure.

Ryan Smith [00:09:43] And, the city just held a kind of one for Spanish speaking residents that had a thousand people attend.

Judith Kelley [00:09:51] That's good.

Ryan Smith [00:09:51] In terms of the task force work, we've had, you know, easily over four or five hundred residents and community leaders participating the task force since the middle of May.

Judith Kelley [00:10:01] Right. Thanks, Ryan. I want to get to Mariel. Mariel, are you happy with the level of mass compliance in Durham right now?

Mariel Beasley [00:10:10] So that's a pretty complicated question because compliance is not actually a binary thing: people either don't comply or do comply. What we're seeing is a very high level of people wearing masks—at least some time. And, you know, I think that our rates are likely higher than that in some other communities, which is wonderful. But one of the things that is challenging is that people have really strong mental models about

when they should be wearing a mask and when they don't need to wear a mask. And people are pretty good about complying in those moments where they, you know, where they have that strong mental model. Oh, this is a case where I should wear a mask. So, for instance, when I go to the grocery store, I should wear a mask. And if you go to the grocery store here in Durham you're going to see everybody is wearing masks. If you go to Home Depot, you're going to see everybody's wearing masks.

Judith Kelley [00:10:56] Sure.

Mariel Beasley [00:10:56] However, what you don't see is places where people feel safe, they have a mental model of the place that they don't need to wear a mask.

Judith Kelley [00:11:04] Right.

Mariel Beasley [00:11:04] Oftentimes when we talk about places where you feel safe and where you know, people, you know, Public Health is referring to sort of your family and your quarantine unit. But a lot of folks have sort of extended that feeling of safety and that safety bubble to friends and to coworkers. And that's really where some of the challenge happens, is that people are very good about wearing masks around strangers. What we're seeing and what we're having sort of a harder time with is is that compliance in those places where people feel safe because they already their co-workers, they trust their co-workers.

Judith Kelley [00:11:35] Now, of course, if everybody just belonged to one bubble, that would be fine. But they don't. Right?

Mariel Beasley [00:11:42] Exactly, exactly.

Judith Kelley [00:11:43] So. So, Mary, how did you get involved with the task force? And what is the back on the bull campaign?

Mariel Beasley [00:11:48] Yeah, Ryan reached out to me early. And usually when Ryan approaches me for something, it's usually a good idea. It's usually something important. So I I try to say yes. And so, you know, Ryan mentioned that the task force was being formed and they really would appreciate and could use some you know behavioral science lens in thinking through the response. You know, of course, at the center were part of Duke, we're here in Durham. We live here. We care deeply about our community. So we sort of jumped at the opportunity to give our time and attention and efforts to think through how can we leverage behavioral science for a faster and better recovery for Durham.

Judith Kelley [00:12:27] Right.

Mariel Beasley [00:12:28] And so one of the things that emerged out of this engagement is this back on the bull campaign. But it really started with kind of walking through the mall. And shortly after it opened and seeing just a wide variety of the way that people were interpreting the things that they should be doing. And what we saw, there were some businesses that had great signs, posted supervision, laying out expectations about what, you know, the customers need to be, you know, should be wearing masks. Appointments are required to enter the store. And they had sort of lines marked out about the ways to travel through the store. And then others who had, you know, densely written, typed word documents in a 12 point font that were printed out and posted in the window that had don't come in if you have any symptoms, wear a mask. But we know from a bit of science

perspective, but also from any type of a design perspective, that nobody's reading that nobody's paying attention to that. That's not catching eyes. That's not influencing behavior at all. And that made us think about what could we do to make it better and more uniform, particularly for our local businesses that have, you know, two people whose job is to figure out how they're keeping operations going and how they're going to make it safe and how they're going to keep paying staff. And, you know, all the other things that they're having to do so. We really kind of focused on just the basic key principles from behavioral science that if you want people to do something, make it incredibly easy for them to. Leverage some social proof, make it feel like it's an expectation and that everybody is doing it. And that's why you got to be doing it as well and give people some accountability on the things that they're doing. So give them an opportunity to commit to it and then have (unintelligible) that accountability is built into that. So that's some of the basic principles under the back on the bull campaign, which is the heart of it. It's a Web site. It's (unintelligible) a website I should say. And you know, there's researchers for for residents, but really the inspiration and the start of this was this health and safety checklist for businesses.

Judith Kelley [00:14:28] Ryan, I want to get you to think a little bit about what it's like operating at the local level versus at the the state and the national responses to the pandemic, I imagine and I as I'm thinking about it. You mentioned earlier, Ryan, that one of the unique features of the situation right now is that Mayor Schewel actually has an incredible amount of authority. However, Mayor Schewel also has a very limited amount of resources. And we think about the national level or the state level. There are potentially a lot of resources available, but the level of authority is not as as obvious. Yet, these different levels of authority seem to have managed to clash. I wonder if you can reflect on some of the unique challenges or needs that sort of face, that local response that are separate from what the state is dealing with and what the national response is to the pandemic. Has it been difficult trying to implement the local response plans due to inconsistencies or contradictory messages, et cetera?

Ryan Smith [00:15:31] I think one of the challenges that is always unique to the local level is the local level. And I think this is this is true in a way that's different than anything at the state or federal level is really about implementation on the ground. And it's about the the people who are living in your community, it's about businesses that you that you might visit. It's complicated because it's about what it means to respond in a particular context with all of the particular players and stakeholders and all the things that make policy implementation really difficult. So that's one of the reasons I really love local politics. So in local government, because of the I think the the extreme complexity that comes into that kind of interpersonal nature of this work, of understanding who's there, figuring out how to work collaboratively with people, of understanding in a local community like Durham, which only got Durham County, got five point, I think eight million dollars in Cares Act funding.

Judith Kelley [00:16:25] That's the, that's the federal funding that was distributed to the...

Ryan Smith [00:16:29] Yes. Compare that to like Wake and Mecklenburg County that got, I believe, each one hundred and ninety million just because of the I think the funding formerly. So, Durham had, you know, that's not a proportional response in terms of population.

Judith Kelley [00:16:46] Right.

Ryan Smith [00:16:46] Durham does not have a lot of money to address these problems. The task force started with a budget of zero dollars. And so we've had we have to be very creative. Part of my job is, I feel always getting our local talent and local resources to contribute in this moment to recognize that this is an unprecedented crisis facing our community. And we need all of our local talent. We need all of it. We need art, you know, everyone to contribute in this moment. Everything can't just be publicly funded. And so we've been very fortunate, as Mariel said, to get. Duke Duke has given a lot of wonderful resources, both in terms of financial resources and in terms of just the, the the kind of, you know, the talent and brainpower that we have at Duke that has been really essential in this McKenny and others. So it is really it's always challenging at the local level. Implementation is difficult.

Judith Kelley [00:17:38] Mariel, do you have any thoughts on messaging at times like this? How do you get messaging out when there are so many disparate communities, people in so many different walks of life, and you are trying to get everybody on the same page and understand that you are trying to do your best.

Mariel Beasley [00:17:56] Yeah, so, I think that two things to consider. One is, we want to make sure that the message, whatever it is that meets people where they are. It's really about you know trying to get messages in in places that they're already talking in places that they're already seeing. So there's kind of that location placement. And then the other thing is that actually a very recent study that just came out looking at changing attitudes around mask wearing, which as many of us know has become kind of a political issue here in the U.S., and essentially what they found and this is not surprising from a behavioral science perspective that the most effective messaging was tapping into already widely held mental models about behavior.

Judith Kelley [00:18:38] Right.

Mariel Beasley [00:18:38] And what I mean by that is rather than talking about the importance of, you know, the science behind the use of masks, rather than talking about you know protecting loved ones as a reason to use masks. Instead there are a few things that we as Americans and people living in the United States actually do quite well from a public health perspective. And two of those things are seatbelts, right. So that's one of the few behaviors that most people, they get in a car, they wear their seatbelt across the political spectrum. And similarly, the wide, wide acceptance of the use of helmets.

Judith Kelley [00:19:12] Right.

Mariel Beasley [00:19:14] And these are two you know public safety things, and individual safety things that that people kind of understand and widely accepted as this is normal.

Judith Kelley [00:19:24] Right.

Mariel Beasley [00:19:24] And what they found is the messaging that leaned into that comparison. And basically said, you know, you put your seatbelt on before you drive, you put your helmet on before you play the game, you know, put your mask on before you go out. That that, actually was the most effective form of messaging to get more people to so that they would wear a mask when going out. So I think it's really that leaning into these widely held beliefs that aren't political, that aren't things that people are arguing about. So that would be my advice for continuing to get that messaging out for individual compliance.

Judith Kelley [00:19:56] Yes, it's difficult indeed, you know, to communicate around these topics. Also, given that we don't have a lot of local news sources and ways of distributing information in a unified way. Mariel, thank you so much for joining us.

Mariel Beasley [00:20:15] Yeah, thank you for having me.

Judith Kelley [00:20:16] So now I am happy to welcome Sanford master public policy candidate Mary Grace Stoneking. Mary Grace was an intern working with the Durham City Manager's office, and she was all during the summer helping Ryan to manage the Recovery and Renewal Task Force. So welcome, Mary Grace.

Mary Grace Stoneking [00:20:36] Thank you so much for having me.

Judith Kelley [00:20:38] It's our pleasure, Mary Grace. So you have had sort of an outsider's view into this and trying to help put everything together. What have you found that you wish the citizens of Durham knew?

Mary Grace Stoneking [00:20:52] I wish they knew how much their voices could be heard right now. And I think that's a really difficult topic considering, you know, historic reasons, legitimate reasons for distrust amongst our community. But it would be really helpful for citizens to know how much the task force is really wanting to know what they're going through and use that to inform their suggestions. If more citizens were able to know that, we would continue to be able to really engage them and have a more accurate picture of what's going on, especially in communities, you know, that haven't been listened to for so long. I think that would be really helpful for the task force in moving forward.

Judith Kelley [00:21:45] Well that's a really valuable message also to get out today. You know, as you've been you're in the middle of getting your policy education. And you know that I'm sure that you've seen the the very popular manual, how to cope with a pandemic. The new one revised edition. You have that book, right?

Mary Grace Stoneking [00:22:04] I do not have that book. I should get it.

Judith Kelley [00:22:08] We should all get that book right. So the thing is, we don't really have a manual. So how have you found translating the lessons that you've learned from the classroom into this situation?

Mary Grace Stoneking [00:22:21] One, it's been amazing to see skills that we've, you know, learned in the classroom actually making impact in real time. And speaking of our entire student research team, who's doing amazing work, and I really think a big message during this time that is really taught in policy is that it's ongoing work. You're never going to have the perfect policy, which I think is something that's beautiful and fascinating about public policy, but also frustrating. But I think when you learn that lesson through classes, through learning about history of policy and how people are, you know, constantly trying to improve our public policy, you know, you always have to leave room for growth and and know that you can always improve upon whatever policy or program you've championed. And I think that's kind of been one of the biggest practical lessons that has come from my classes at Sanford and also really experience in this internship.

Judith Kelley [00:23:32] And I imagine that it's particularly pronounced in a situation like this where policy literally has to be revised based on new evidence, sometimes on a weekly basis.

Mary Grace Stoneking [00:23:45] Yeah, I mean, honestly, from my perspective, in this experience, I think we could use more of that in policy day to day. And I know this this pandemic in general, right, has brought to light many different areas of improvement and all policy, including just historic structures that really need to be changed as we see with the racial inequities that are really being brought to light during this time as well. You know, we can do more to not just be satisfied with the status quo and understand. New research comes out. We know that especially during this time, continuously questioning, I think, is really good. And I think you can do that in a way that keeps things stable.

Judith Kelley [00:24:43] Yes. Now, this is a very good point that this type of flexible, continual updating is something we need to apply to all areas of policy and all areas of life. And if there's anything that we can take away from this pandemic, surely it should be insights about such things, insights about, as you mentioned, structural inequalities and other things that have been laid bare by the pandemic. So hopefully we'll take some of these some of these silver linings, so to speak, with us. Ryan, so in addition to having Mary Grace work with you, you've ended up having, I think up to 20 volunteers or more are working with U.S. research assistants for the task force students, recent graduates from Duke and NCCU, UNC. So how have the students, including Mary Grace, helped the task force over the summer?

Ryan Smith [00:25:44] Yeah, thanks. You, first let me just say, Mary Grace, we've been so fortunate to have you work with us this summer and you have been such an asset to the task force. And I have shared that with you and shared that with the mayor and others. But I'd be remiss if I didn't start off with a big debt of gratitude to you. And then I've really enjoyed working with you this summer.

Judith Kelley [00:26:02] As a matter of fact, he doesn't even want you to go back to school. He just wants to keep you.

Ryan Smith [00:26:08] That's right! I've already e-mailed the dean and said, how can we how can we keep Mary Grace on the task force?

Mary Grace Stoneking [00:26:13] Well, it's been an amazing experience for me as well. And while I love Sanford so much, it's definitely made me be like, well, maybe I can just work for the city. But I'm glad I can I can keep contributing and continue honing my skills at Sanford as well.

Ryan Smith [00:26:32] Yeah. Finish your education. Definitely.

Judith Kelley [00:26:34] Then you'll be able to do things like Ryan afterwards. So, Ryan, so what have the what have the students been doing?

Ryan Smith [00:26:41] What we have charged the students with is there are different ways in which they are supporting the work they we have, priority research questions. And for anyone who's ever been a Sanford NPP student listening to this podcast, I would say think of this as a reminder of why the 48 hour memo or whatever it was called that we all did in our in our MPP class, where we had to come together on something we knew nothing about and write a memo over two days. It's like that on repeat every week. And so students get priority research questions and they're given a challenge to go out there and see what you can learn over the course of this this week. And they prepare memos. They're not experts on these subjects. They have to go and curate a lot of information,

decide what matters. Put that into a short one or two page memo. And we then my job is to take all of that information and get it to the hands of the of the decision makers who it can support. So whether that's the mayor or whether it's our vulnerable population team. So we are getting every week a number of memos from our students on a wide range of topics from what our community is doing around voluntary compliance. We had this great memo from one of our, I think, Sanford students on. On that topic and highlighted the way that some cities are using kind of ambassador models to kind of social distancing ambassador models to ways that they're using their inspections departments and others. And we have used that, too, as an example. And we just got approval from city council the other day where we're creating a community health ambassador program that will provide support to businesses and establishments. One hundred and fifty a week to help them make sure they understand what our locals local orders are. Make sure that they have the support they need to come into compliance with those orders. And you know that's something that our students laid great groundwork for. So they're doing that kind of work. We also have these 20 roundtables that we're running either every week or every other week. And I think so much of what this student team is doing is. There is so much information out there, and we need a team that can process all that information in a way that it can really inform decision makers. And so with our roundtables, each of them are an hour a week. That's 20 hours of meetings. That's all these comments and insights and things that are being shared and concerns. Every, our students are charged with being responsible for a roundtable and summarizing it in a way that is actionable, in a way that we can think about it and make sense of what are the things? What are the questions that people have? What are the ideas that they have? What are the things that we need to respond to? So students have been very helpful in in that important type of. I wouldn't call it notetaking. I would call it really taking meetings and making information coming out of those meetings relevant at a policy level.

Judith Kelley [00:29:23] Right. And I'm very appreciative of both of you joining me today. But before you sign off, I want to invite your thoughts. You know, we are by no means out of the weeds here in North Carolina. So what do you have to say to local residents here in Durham and all over the country, for that matter? What is your message?

Ryan Smith [00:29:49] I think the one thing I would encourage our residents to do is that we have to remain vigilant and it's going to be really important over the fall that we remember the basic things about the importance of wearing a face mask, the importance of maintaining social distance. Those things are really important and they're really important if we want our children to resume in-person instruction, which in Durham, they are not for the first nine weeks of public school. We all, I think one thing, I would say, is we all have a responsibility in this moment. Shutting our community down took the decision of two people, Steve Schewel and Wendy Jacobs, reopening the community, reengaging. Being able to kind of combat COVID-19 in a way that doesn't require that costly decision that takes all of us and it takes all of us being committed. All of us. I mean, we get weary. I don't know about you. I'm so weary of COVID-19. I'm weary of wearing a facemask. I want to be able to spend more time in person with my friends. I want that. I'm sure we all want that. I'm hopeful that vaccine research is as is advancing as fast as I hear that it is. But I think if we can all try to continue to do these things and not let our guard down and not get weary, then we'll be better positioned. I think that our children can, if we are all committed to these things, begin in person instruction, hopefully soon. But it's going to take that sense of continued vigilance.

Judith Kelley [00:31:12] Mary Grace, I don't know if you have a final a final thought as well that you would like to share.

Mary Grace Stoneking [00:31:19] Yeah, I guess I just want to reiterate that this is a great time for citizens to come to these town halls and really voice ideas and what's happening in their lives and their experiences, because, you know, the task force is not just working to stop the spread of COVID-19, which is obviously a very big role for the task force. But they're also thinking about how we can lift up, you know, those who are most socio economically vulnerable in our community. And also, you know, they they have been thinking and the mayor has mentioned this during taskforce meetings that, you know. They don't just want to make, you know, survive this pandemic, but even look towards making a better Durham after the pandemic. The more citizens can tell what's happening in their lives and how they're being affected, that can really inform what the task force suggests and in what the city and county do as a response to all these complicated issues.

Judith Kelley [00:32:37] Thank you so much. Mary Grace. And I want to thank the two of you for all the work you're doing. And I I asked you, one of you earlier, what would you wish the citizens of Durham knew? And the one thing I I wish that everybody would know is just how much our mayor is putting his heart and his soul into every decision that he is making on behalf of the citizens of Durham. And as we mentioned before, nobody is going to get all the decisions right. But I know that Mayor Schewel is, is working on behalf of the citizens of Durham with the with the best intentions and bringing the best ideas and the best evidence to bear that is known at the time. And we're very lucky to have a mayor like Steve Schewel who really cares about us and is very thankful for the countless hours that he is putting in round the clock. So I want to thank both of you for joining me today. I wish I could tell you to give the major a hug next time you saw him, but you're not allowed. But in spirit, we send one. Well, thank you both for joining me today. Ryan Smith is the innovation team project manager for the city of Durham. And he has been involved in the city's response since the beginning or near the beginning of the outbreak and was tapped to head the Recovery and Renewal Task Force. Mariel Beasley is the principal at Duke Center for Advanced Hindsight and co-director of Duke's Common Sense Lab. She researches behavioral economics and worked on the Back on the Bull campaign. And Mary Grace Stoneking is currently pursuing a master's of public policy at the Sanford School of Public Policy at Duke University. She was an intern with the Durham City Manager's office and is continuing to collaborate with that office. So thank you all for your work on the local response to the pandemic. And you can learn more about the Recovery and Renewal Task Force at our Web site, Policy 360 dot org. We're going to be back soon with another conversation. I'm Judith Kelly. And wash your hands. Stay six feet from one another. Put on that mask. Thank you.